



**2015 Modern Studies Paper 1**

**Higher**

**Finalised Marking Instructions**

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2015

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from SQA's NQ Assessment team.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Assessment team may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

## **Part One: General Marking Principles for: Modern Studies Paper 1**

This information is provided to help you understand the general principles you must apply when marking candidate responses to questions in this Paper. These principles must be read in conjunction with the specific Marking Instructions for each question.

- (a)** Marks for each candidate response must always be assigned in line with these general marking principles and the specific Marking Instructions for the relevant question. If a specific candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed Marking Instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your Team Leader/Principal Assessor.
- (b)** Marking should always be positive ie, marks should be awarded for what is correct and not deducted for errors or omissions.

### **GENERAL MARKING ADVICE: Modern Studies Paper 1**

The marking schemes are written to assist in determining the “minimal acceptable answer” rather than listing every possible correct and incorrect answer. The following notes are offered to support Markers in making judgements on candidates’ evidence, and apply to marking both end of unit assessments and course assessments.

**Part Two: Marking Instructions for each Question**

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	1	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The devolved/reserved powers/matters as set out in the Scotland Act 1998.</li> <li>• Alternative proposals for the constitution.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment on/analysis of the extent to which changes to the SP will enhance its effectiveness.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <p>The devolved powers of the Scottish Parliament include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Health</li> <li>• Education</li> <li>• Local Government</li> <li>• Law</li> <li>• Social Work and Housing</li> <li>• Economic Development and Transport</li> <li>• The Environment; Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing; Sport and the Arts</li> </ul> <p>Additional powers contained in the Scotland Act 2012 (to be implemented 2015) and closely follows the final recommendations of the review of devolution (Calman Commission):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scottish income tax rate to raise around 35% of revenue/Scotland-specific taxes (including stamp duty and landfill taxes)</li> <li>• Airguns legislation; drink driving legislation; national speed limits</li> <li>• Scottish Parliament will be able to borrow more money</li> <li>• Scottish Parliament will be able to issue bonds to access cash from capital markets</li> <li>• Implications of the 2014 referendum on independence – calls for greater extension of powers ie Devo max.</li> <li>• But UK Parliament still controls (reserved powers):</li> <li>• Most taxes and benefits</li> <li>• Employment</li> <li>• Constitutional arrangements including Acts of Parliament to grant further powers or independence to Scotland</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	1	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p>Examples of the Scottish Parliament delivering effective government without new powers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Smoking ban in enclosed public spaces (before rest of UK). Other measures to reduce smoking/ improve health</li> <li>• Free personal care for elderly</li> <li>• Abolition of prescription charges</li> <li>• No university tuition fees</li> <li>• Reduced drink driving limits</li> <li>• Legislation on sectarianism, minimum pricing and compensation for asbestos sufferers</li> </ul> <p>Arguments that new powers make little difference</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Issue for SNP is that changes suggested by the Smith Commission and included in the new Scotland Act still stop short of Independence.</li> <li>• SNP also claim that the Scotland Act is even short of the “vow” made by Cameron, Miliband and Clegg during the referendum campaign.</li> <li>• Claims that full Federalism would be best way for Scotland.</li> </ul>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	1	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p>Proposals of the Smith Commission may be considered as either adding or detracting from the effectiveness of the Scottish Parliament.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Complete power to set income tax rates and bands.</li> <li>• The Scottish parliament to receive 50% of VAT collected in Scotland but no power to vary VAT rate.</li> <li>• Increased borrowing powers</li> <li>• UK legislation to state that the Scottish Parliament and Scottish Government are permanent institutions.</li> <li>• Powers to legislate over how it is elected and run.</li> <li>• Power to extend the vote to 16 and 17 year-olds, allowing them to vote in the Scottish election 2016.</li> <li>• Control over a number of benefits including Disability Living Allowance, Personal Independence Payments, winter fuel payments, parts of universal credit (including the bedroom tax).</li> <li>• Powers to make discretionary welfare payments without the need to obtain prior permission from Westminster.</li> <li>• Powers to support unemployed people through employment programmes, mainly delivered at present through the Work Programme</li> <li>• Control over air passenger duty charged on passengers flying from Scottish airports.</li> <li>• Licensing of onshore oil and gas extraction underlying Scotland to be devolved to the Scottish parliament.</li> <li>• The block grant from the UK government to Scotland will continue to be determined via the operation of the Barnett formula</li> <li>• MPs representing constituencies across the whole of the UK to continue to decide the UK's budget, including income tax. (perhaps at odds with "English Votes for English Laws")</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	2	<p><b>'Pass' and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The role of the Cabinet in the UK Central Government</li> <li>• Other influences on decision making in UK Central Government</li> <li>• Balanced comment/analysis of the view that the Cabinet has the most important role in decision making in UK Central Government</li> </ul> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cabinet is the collective/executive decision making body in UK political system. It meets every Tuesday but also holds extra meetings in times of "national emergency".</li> <li>• Cabinet composed of most senior members of ruling party/parties. Around 22 paid Ministers form the Cabinet plus several select others. Current cabinet is Conservative/Liberal Democrat coalition.</li> <li>• Prime Ministers seek to have a confident, united Cabinet.</li> <li>• Parliamentary majority normally means that the Executive, with assistance from Parliamentary whips, can have legislation passed by Parliament.</li> <li>• Prime Ministers and the Government cannot rule effectively without high degree of Cabinet unanimity eg Brown said to be undermined by lack of Cabinet support. Cameron needs degree of consensus with Clegg and Lib Dems.</li> <li>• Prime Minister selects Cabinet and can re-shuffle. A power limited by coalition agreements.</li> <li>• Prime Minister uses powers of patronage to secure Cabinet compliance.</li> <li>• Prime Minister can use collective responsibility to neutralise Cabinet members. Liberal Democrat cabinet members have often been more outspoken on matters of policy.</li> <li>• Dominance of PM "first among equals"</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	2	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Role of the media and election campaigns have heightened the “Presidential” nature of modern politics.</li> <li>• Tony Blair relied on “sofa government”; SPADS (special advisers) and inner Cabinet ignoring Cabinet on key decisions.</li> <li>• David Cameron is not as in control as previous Prime Ministers, with Lib Dem Cabinet Ministers in Cabinet eg Vince Cable’s Sky comments and comments on Cameron’s immigration proposals as well as comments opposing Cameron’s policy of “renegotiation” with Europe.</li> <li>• Cabinet resignations sapped the morale and confidence of Brown.</li> <li>• Parliament can defeat the Executive; both the Commons eg detention without trial and the House of Lords (ID cards) have defeated Government in recent times; HoL defeated Government on benefit reforms several times. LibDem/Con coalition suffered over 100 individual defeats in the House of Lords by the end of their term in 2015.</li> <li>• The importance of the Cabinet decision making process depends upon the specific nature and composition of the Government. The Con/Lib Dem Cabinet has to be more collegiate given the nature of coalition government.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	3	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The role of the party leader in policy making within different political parties in the UK</li> <li>• Extent to which other individuals/institutions within the party decide party policy</li> <li>• Balanced comment/analysis of the extent to which the party leader influences party policy.</li> </ul> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <p><b>Conservative Party/Scottish Conservative Party</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Traditionally a central role in policy formulation for leader/leadership.</li> <li>• Party leadership given great freedom from conference etc. Policy should evolve as events dictate.</li> <li>• National Conservative Convention and Conservative Political Forum allow party members to have input into policy but they remain advisory.</li> <li>• Conservative backbench 1922 Committee is sometimes referred to as “the men in grey suits”. They do not make decisions but the party leader takes great stock of their views.</li> <li>• Party policy is essentially “top down”.</li> <li>• Party conference is deferential towards the party leadership. Conference “decisions” are not binding.</li> <li>• Divisions within Scottish Conservatives; Ruth Davidson did not win a majority of first preference votes in leadership election. Some Scottish Conservatives not in favour of “Devo-Max” stand of Conservatives during referendum campaign</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	3	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Labour Party/Scottish Labour Party</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Labour Party consists of Constituency Labour Parties, affiliated trade unions, socialist societies and the Co-operative Party with which it has an electoral agreement.</li> <li>• Labour Party members tend to be more “ideological” than Conservatives and seek a greater input into party policy.</li> <li>• Policy in the Labour Party is made through a process called Partnership in Power (PiP) which is designed to involve all party stakeholders (inc. ordinary party members). PiP does this through a rolling programme of policy development and a year-round dialogue between the party and government. Development of policy is carried out by six policy commissions.</li> <li>• Members who are elected to parliamentary positions take part in the Parliamentary Labour Party (PLP).</li> <li>• Party’s decision-making bodies at a national level formally include the National Executive Committee (NEC), Labour Party Conference and National Policy Forum (NPF) although in practice the parliamentary leadership has the final say on policy.</li> <li>• The Labour Party Constitution states that Party policies making up the Labour Party programme should be approved by the Conference, subject to receiving two thirds support. The election manifesto, which consists of policies from the programme, has to be agreed between the parliamentary leadership and the NEC.</li> <li>• Leadership/NEC proposes programme and conference votes to support/reject programme with CLPs, affiliated organisations and trade unions having weighting according to number of members.</li> <li>• New Labour leader in Scotland, Jim Murphy, is anxious to show he is not controlled by the UK party leadership - 1000 new nursing jobs in Scotland funded by the “mansion tax” creating conflict with London.</li> </ul>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	3	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Liberal Democrats/Scottish Liberal Democrats</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Policy making body is the Federal Conference. Twice a year, in spring and autumn, elected representatives from the Liberal Democrat constituency parties assemble at the party conference to establish federal party policy. Representatives from every local party, organised around parliamentary constituencies, are elected to attend federal conference.</li> <li>• Conference decides policy matters on national and 'English' issues; separate Scottish Liberal Democrat Party makes policy decisions on Scottish issues.</li> <li>• Every two years, conference representatives elect a Federal Policy Committee (FPC) which is responsible for the production of the policy papers that are debated at Conference, and is responsible for election manifestos. Party members discuss policy papers in local and regional meetings, and their representatives then debate and vote on policy motions and papers at Conference. Conference also debates motions submitted by local parties and conference representatives.</li> <li>• Clegg's position within coalition government as Deputy Prime Minister.</li> </ul> <p><b>Scottish National Party</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Until the referendum Alex Salmond dominated the SNP. SNP included 'Alex Salmond for First Minister' on 2011 regional list ballot papers. His personality was seen as SNP's greatest asset. Nicola Sturgeon is seen as a different type of leader but her personality was important in the referendum and remains so as a driving force behind SNP policy.</li> <li>• Members can submit motions on policy and national strategy to be discussed by the party at national level.</li> <li>• Local branches are drawn together to form a Constituency Association (CA). Branches and CAs send representatives to the two national bodies that agree the policies of the Party.</li> </ul>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	3	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The National Council and Annual National Conference. Annual Conference is the supreme governing body of the Party and elects the National Executive Committee, the leadership of the Party, which deals with the day-to-day running of its affairs.</li> <li>• SNP Annual National conferences have, like other major party conferences, become less of a policy making body as the party has become a party of Government. Many see conference as a “rubber stamp” for the policy ideas primarily put forward by the leader (and by the cabinet)</li> <li>• Credit reference to other influential factors such as, media coverage, public opinion, policies of other parties (eg influence of media, public opinion and UKIP policy on Conservative/Labour immigration policy)</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
A	4	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The factors affecting voting behaviour.</li> <li>• The relative importance of different factors affecting voting behaviour.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> Balance comment/analysis on the view that some of the factors affecting voting behaviour are more important than others.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A range of factors are said to affect voting behaviour including: Media, Social class, Age, Gender, Residence, Ethnicity, Image of party leader, Policy issues.</li> <li>• Credit highly (candidates) who integrate different factors. For example, social class and media can be seen as separate factors but they are related. Professional class voters may access different newspapers, television and websites from working/manual class voters and are therefore, exposed to a different set of media influences.</li> <li>• Models of voting behaviour including social structures model and rational choice model. Debate as to extent to which rational choice model has taken over from social structures model. Some commentators (Sarlvik and Crewe) argue that absolute class voting and relative class voting have steadily declined and that “issue voting” has become more important. Others (Heath) argue that although class voting has declined it remains the most important underlying factor affecting voting behaviour. The most recent studies (Manza, Hunt and Brooks) agree more with Heath.</li> <li>• Tactical voting, De-alignment, Third party choices, Non-voting.</li> <li>• Evidence of voting patterns from 2010 UK General Election, 2011 Scottish Election, recent by-elections, Scottish Independence Referendum. Discussion of relative importance of different factors eg importance of Libyan/Syrian conflicts in relation to Muslim vote, emphasis placed on successful media campaign by political parties, impact of “economic crisis/recession”, etc.</li> <li>• Credit answers which frame their discussion around the Scottish Independence Referendum eg single issue voting, leadership personalities, negative campaigning, gender, class, geography, age etc.</li> <li>• Any other relevant points</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
B	5	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The link between poverty and health.</li> <li>• Other factors that may also affect health.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis considering the extent to which poverty is the most important factor that affects good health.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Health reports including “Equally Well” (2008); annual “Health in Scotland” reports; research from Glasgow Centre for Population Health; WHO Lenzie/Calton Report 2008, etc. Statistics in terms of mortality and morbidity. Scottish Government figures show that in 2007: average life expectancy for males in Scotland was 74.9 but only 57.3 years in most deprived area. East Dunbartonshire was 78.0 years for males. Under 75 deaths from heart disease and cancer were markedly higher in most deprived areas. (Ministerial Task Force on Inequalities of Health – 2007). Audit Scotland’s report “Health Inequalities in Scotland” published in December 2012.</li> <li>• Impact of low income: welfare dependency poor housing run down local environment and effect on physical and mental health. Oxfam’s “FRED”: Forgotten, Ripped off, Excluded, Debt</li> <li>• Harry Burns’ research on “biology of poverty”. Experience of being brought up in “chaotic circumstances” has an effect on the body’s immune system leading to a more unhealthy life, longer recovery from illnesses/operations and lower life expectancy.</li> <li>• Other factors may include: lifestyle choices (inc. smoking, alcohol, diet, drug misuse and exercise) hereditary factors gender race availability and uptake of preventative medical care access to private medical care.</li> <li>• Credit highly candidates who avoid over simplification and acknowledge that certain health issues transcend class differences eg alcohol misuse or lack of exercise.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
B	6	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government health and welfare provision.</li> <li>• The debate over government/individual responsibility for health and welfare</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment on/analysis as to whether or not health and welfare provision should be the responsibility of government.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• UK and Scottish Government health and welfare provision may include: National Health Service</li> <li>• Benefits – JSA, State Retirement Pension, Pension Credit, Child Benefit, Income Support, Employment Support Allowance, tax credits, free prescriptions in Scotland, etc.</li> <li>• Founding principles of the Welfare State – universalism with flat-rate contributions (NI) giving “cradle to grave” coverage.</li> <li>• Debate over extent of government health and welfare provision.</li> <li>• Individualism and collectivism. Individualists stress importance of self-reliance and need to avoid a “dependency culture” whereas collectivists stress importance of fairness and equality in society.</li> <li>• Labour’s “Third Way” – policy of “welfare to work”.</li> <li>• Increased use of means testing welfare system against a background of rising costs.</li> <li>• Impact of an ageing population. Future rises in ratio of dependents to workers.</li> <li>• Widening of health and wealth gaps between most and least affluent.</li> <li>• NHS budgets protected in era of austerity - debate over winter crisis and responsibility of general public.</li> <li>• SNP Scottish Government has been collectivist in approach eg free prescriptions and free school meals P1–3.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
B	6	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Major political parties agree that a health and welfare provision is the responsibility of both the Government and the individual. The role of Government is to help the individual help themselves.</li> <li>• Cameron's view on welfare – big government is wasteful and fails; talks of “social entrepreneurs and community action”; “The Big Society” idea seen as empowering local communities and breaking dependency on the state.</li> <li>• Recent government reforms to the welfare system (Welfare Reform Bill 2012) shows shift away from government responsibility towards individualism.</li> <li>• Bedroom Tax, Universal Credit, benefits cap, increases below inflation, overall welfare cuts.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	7	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Main features of the South African political system/extent of ANC support.</li> <li>• The debate surrounding the ANC and their use of power.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis of the view that the political strength of the ANC threatens democracy.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• South Africa is a constitutional democracy with a three-tier system of government.</li> <li>• Federal state with nine provincial governments.</li> <li>• Bicameral parliament elected every five years (last election was May 2014), comprising the 400 seat National Assembly and the 90-seat National Council of Provinces.</li> <li>• Local government elected for four years; 284 metropolitan, district and local municipalities.</li> <li>• Party List electoral system.</li> <li>• 13 political groups represented in National Assembly.</li> <li>• Constitution guarantees many rights including property rights and education; two-thirds of members of Parliament and at least 6 provinces need to support change to Constitution.</li> <li>• 2014 was 5th General Election since Apartheid era, each won by ANC with large majorities. ANC obtained 62.2% of votes to National Assembly (249/400 seats). ANC also won 8/9 of the provincial legislatures. National Council of the Provinces has 90 members - ANC 60 with DA 20 Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) has 7 – the remaining 3 seats shared between 3 smaller parties. ANC President Jacob Zuma.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	7	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• However, ANC share of the vote continues to fall in General elections. Continued dominance helped by fragmented opposition and inability of any party to mount a sustained challenge eg IFP or COPE</li> <li>• The IFP won its biggest share of the vote in Kwa-Zulu Natal but that was only 11% compared to the ANC's 65%.</li> <li>• The last Municipal (local authority) elections were in 2011. The DA won the largest share of votes in the City of Cape Town but no majority. The ANC lost votes to the DA in every Province apart from Kwa-Zulu Natal where it took votes from the IFP. Despite a slight drop in overall votes the ANC managed to win the vast majority of municipalities. In four provinces they won all municipalities.</li> <li>• 13 different political parties are represented in Parliament.</li> <li>• Main opposition to the ANC is the Democratic Alliance which is still some way behind the ANC nationally but does have pockets of strong local/provincial support especially in the Western Cape. It gained 22% of the vote (largely white and Asian support) in the 2014 general election but won the Western Cape Province with 59% of the vote.</li> <li>• The constitution provides for freedom of the press, and this is generally respected. Laws, regulation and political control of media content are considered to be moderate and there is little evidence of repressive measures against journalists.</li> <li>• Newspapers and magazines publish reports and comments critical of the government, although the state-owned SABC is less likely to criticise.</li> <li>• Hallmarks of democracy present: stable economy, survival of the constitution despite ANC's dominance for the whole of the post-apartheid era, many opposition parties and pressure groups, legal system pursuing corruption.</li> <li>• Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act of 2004 a person in a position of authority who knows or reasonably suspects another person of fraud must report it to the police.</li> </ul>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	7	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Various corruption scandals that have affected the ANC. COPE made corruption an issue in 2009 election. Zuma has had corruption charges levelled against him on more than one occasion. COPE lost a great deal of its support at the 2014 election due to its own internal divisions. The Economic Freedom Fighters have emerged as the third party in the National Congress and present a radical alternative to the ANC.</li> <li>• Several respected organisations including SA trade unions have said that fraud and corruption could compromise the rule of law. Helen Zille said in October 2009 that the ruling party is subverting the constitution and judiciary.</li> <li>• Deputy President Motlanthe stated in August 2010 that fight against crime and corruption must first start with ANC; speech came after two major corruption scandals involving high profile ANC figures.</li> <li>• In 2008, Mbeki disbanded the Scorpions a combined police and prosecution unit that investigated corruption. Mbeki also dismissed independent head of the National Prosecution Authority.</li> <li>• Motlanthe says he stands by rule of law and independent judiciary. Independent and well respected lawyer Edwin Cameron appointed to Constitutional Court.</li> <li>• 2010 Media Bill (Protection of Information Bill) seen as threat to press freedom.</li> <li>• Effectiveness of opposition parties – arguably still somewhat fragmented and divided. Some evidence ANC tolerates opposition rather than respects.</li> <li>• Concerns about ANC intolerance towards media opposition.</li> <li>• Criticism by Archbishop Tutu that Zuma’s ANC was “worse than apartheid rulers”. Claims ANC has lost touch with its roots and its leaders corrupted by power.</li> <li>• The office of the Public Protector was established by the current constitution. The PP has the power to investigate any level of government when a complaint regarding corruption has been made.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	8	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sources of political opposition to the Chinese Communist Party (CPC)</li> <li>• Extent of effective political opposition within China as a whole</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis on the extent of opposition to the Communist Party in China</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dissidents eg Hu Jia who was sent to prison for 3-5 years ahead of Olympic Games but few in number.</li> <li>• Minorities eg Xinjiang and Tibet and related separatist movements. At least 140 people killed in rioting in Xinjiang (July '09). Increasing Tibetan protests involving self-immolation leading to police crackdowns, closure of monasteries and the arrest of prominent monks.</li> <li>• Provinces eg Guangdong has a reputation of not following central government directives.</li> <li>• Hong Kong: ‘One China Two Systems’ and Taiwan’s continued detachment from China. Former Hong Kong Governor Chris Patten sees China as threat to ‘democracy’</li> <li>• 2014. “Umbrella Movement” protests in Hong Kong leading to violent unrest and a police crackdown.</li> <li>• Poor, unemployed/under-employed, landless. Up to 20m migrants forced to return to countryside as result of downturn in economy.</li> <li>• Rise in levels of web-based dissent eg through blogs and chatrooms. Highest number of journalists in prison for internet offences such as signing on-line petitions and contacting foreign protest groups. Many of the recent protests (including those in Hong Kong) have been organised and publicised through the internet and social media.</li> <li>• The government places close controls on Chinese Internet service Providers and monitors the internet access of millions of citizens. It is estimated that the Internet police employs two million people.</li> <li>• Middle classes who have gained economic power and social status but no real political power.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	8	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Crackdown on protest before and during Olympic Games.</li> <li>• Numerous local and environmental protests involving crowds of up to 30,000. There were a total of 120,000 “mass incidents” in 2008. Tension remained high in 2009 (20 years since Tiananmen Sq. protests/50 years of CPC rule).</li> <li>• Greater criticism allowed of corrupt local officials. Renewed crackdown after Sichuan earthquake. Reaction to contaminated milk scandal.</li> <li>• No general opposition to CPC; marginalised and disparate. Rises in the general standard of living, especially in urban areas, have reduced criticism of CPC. Consensus is that there is little demand for political change beyond “nationalist” campaigns in Hong Kong and Tibet.</li> <li>• There are eight other political parties in China but are not in opposition to the CPC. Parties may participate in Government decisions but not allowed formal organisational status so can’t raise funds or campaign.</li> <li>• No free trade union association. ACFTU seen as tool of CPC.</li> <li>• Treatment of members of Falun Gong. Seen as a threat to Communist rule</li> <li>• Wide range of powers available to Chinese authorities to silence political protestors.</li> <li>• Arrest, imprisonment, house arrest, etc. Catch-all subversion, sedition and leaking of State secrets laws.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	9	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The powers of the US President</li> <li>• Constitutional/practical limits to these powers</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis on the extent to which these limits are effective</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <p><b>Presidential powers</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chief executive – takes care that the laws are faithfully executed</li> <li>• Commander in Chief of Armed Forces (power to wage war). President has the limited power to deploy troops abroad for a maximum of 60 days without congressional approval.</li> <li>• Responsible for negotiating treaties</li> <li>• Chief formulator of public policy</li> <li>• Power of appointment – some 6000 federal government positions. Many do not require congressional approval.</li> <li>• Executive Orders do not require congressional approval; responsible for declaring a state of emergency. EO’s can be overturned by the courts or in theory by congress. Obama had signed almost 200 EOs by the end of 2014</li> <li>• Can veto an Act of Congress (including pocket veto)</li> <li>• Can grant reprieves and pardons without confirmation</li> <li>• Executive Privilege ie the right to withhold certain information from the public.</li> <li>• ‘extraordinary’ powers (Bush administration in the war against terror)</li> <li>• Presidential ‘interventions’ (university admissions policies, Schiavo case)</li> </ul> <p><b>Limits on Presidential powers</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Congress has the sole power to declare war</li> <li>• Congress sets the budget of the executive. Obama’s problems in having his budget passed and borrowing levels authorised by a Republican dominated House of Representatives led to the shutdown of Federal Government Agencies in 2013. Such shutdowns have happened to other recent Presidents.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	9	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Congress has the sole power to pass Constitutional amendments (by 2/3 majority and with the consent of 3/4 of the states)</li> <li>• Congress cannot restrict the President's power to terminate executive appointments (but can for non-executive agencies)</li> <li>• A 2/3 majority in each house overrides any veto [except a pocket-veto]. A President's power can be seriously restricted if the Congress is dominated by the other main party eg 1/3 of all President George W Bush's vetoes were overturned by Congress. By the end of 2014 Obama had only used the power to veto twice. The election of a Republican Congress in the 2014 mid-term elections may change this?</li> <li>• House impeaches with a simple majority and Senate convicts with a 2/3 majority</li> <li>• Senate is responsible for ratifying treaties – requires 2/3 majority</li> <li>• Senate's advice and consent required for appointment of Cabinet members, ambassadors, judges and other senior executive officers. President nominates Supreme Court justices but this must be confirmed by the Senate. As appointments are for life, some Presidents are faced with a Supreme Court largely appointed by their predecessors/political opponents. Obama has appointed two Supreme Court Justices but five out of the nine were appointed by previous Republican Presidents. Supreme Court can block legislation on constitutional grounds.</li> <li>• Senate must confirm nominations of the heads of all executive departments and agencies, together with hundreds of other high-ranking federal officials</li> <li>• The filibuster as an acknowledged check on the executive: compromise between Democrats and Republicans when Democrats threatened to block a vote on 10 Bush nominees and were threatened with the 'nuclear option'</li> <li>• Significance of separate elections for President and Congress. Obama faces a "hostile" Congress. Limits placed on Presidential powers by the eight year limit on a President's service. Politicians, media and electorate are already looking to next President. ie second term "lame duck"?</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	10	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The role and powers of the European Parliament.</li> <li>• The powers of the other EU institutions.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis of the importance of the decision making powers of the European Parliament within the European Union.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The European Parliament has 751 elected members; one of three key decision-making institutions.</li> <li>• The European Parliament has say in 80% policy areas including agriculture and home affairs issue. Role in legislative process expanded over time as the scope of EU policy has grown.</li> <li>• Amsterdam Treaty – the European Parliament and European Council sharing legislative power and must both approve a Commission proposal to become law. Lisbon Treaty enhancing the European Parliament’s role even further as its role of forming a bicameral legislature alongside the European Council becomes the ordinary procedure.</li> <li>• Votes on Commission’s programme and monitors management of EU policies through oral and written questions.</li> <li>• Role in EU’s legislative and budgetary processes and general supervision of the Council and the European Commission.</li> <li>• Budget – the European Parliament and European Council have joint powers.</li> <li>• Has right to dismiss entire Commission through a vote of censure. May also reject newly-proposed Commission and individual members</li> <li>• The president of The European Council must report to the Parliament after every one of its meetings and the Parliament has the right to question members of the Commission at “Commission Question Time” once a week. MEPs can also make requests for legislation to the Commission.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	10	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The European Parliament must approve new member states and all agreements entered into with non-member countries – eg trade agreements.</li> <li>• Co-decision does not cover all aspects of EU policy eg tax and foreign affairs.</li> <li>• Increasing checks and balance role, and increased forum for debate on international issues, although foreign policy rests with member states.</li> <li>• The Council is the main EU decision making body, comprising Ministers from national</li> <li>• Discusses proposals put forward by the Commission, amends if necessary, but is then passed to the European Parliament in its role within a bicameral procedure.</li> <li>• As decisions by the Council are subject to qualified majority voting (QMV) rather than unanimity (increases speed and efficiency in decision making) the Parliament's role seen as an increasingly important democratic counterweight.</li> <li>• The Commission initiates legislation. It is the executive and guarantor of treaties.</li> <li>• Post Lisbon Treaty the future of the new constitutional arrangements in doubt as France and Netherlands and Ireland initially voted NO, adding to the claim that there is no public interest or engagement in the EU Parliament.</li> <li>• Strain on the EU with regard to debt and future of the EU; national governments having to address not EU Parliament.</li> <li>• David Cameron's opposition to the appointment of Jean-Claude Juncker as President if the European Commission shows that UK government believe this institution to be more powerful/ effective in changing the nature/regulations of the EU.</li> <li>• UK Government threatening to ignore EU Parliament and EU treaties in order to impose restrictions on the free movement of labour.</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	11	<p><b>‘Pass’ and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Foreign aid in its various forms.</li> <li>• Factors that limit the effectiveness of foreign aid.</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment/analysis of the effectiveness of foreign aid in promoting development.</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The impact of aid from international organisations, national governments (eg DIFD) and NGOs (eg Oxfam, Save the Children, etc).</li> <li>• Work of UN agencies (WHO, UNESCO, FAO, UNICEF) and programmes (WFP, etc).</li> <li>• Candidates may adopt a case study approach eg Malawi irrigation scheme in Thyolo area giving small plots of land and advice to farmers. However, government withdrawal of financial support for these extension services in the expectation of private sector investment, which has not happened. Action Aid blames World Bank with its fixation on agriculture for economic growth and not food supply.</li> <li>• Debate that aid is needed to promote development/save lives and those who see aid as encouraging dependency.</li> <li>• <b>Fifteen years since Millennium Development Goals.</b> Progress towards all goals – extensive poverty and hunger reduction, improvements in primary education enrolment and child mortality rates, reductions in HIV/AIDS rates, etc, but sub-Saharan Africa remains poorest continent. Ebola outbreak in North West Africa threatens further progress in these areas – importance of aid in combating this</li> <li>• The impact of debt/debt cancellation. Annually, debt repayments exceed aid received. Structural adjustment programmes made things worse – only 5 countries cleared debt under HIPC (Heavily Indebted Poor Country) initiative.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	11	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• View the ‘free trade’ not ‘free aid’ will do more to promote development; cycle of dependency.</li> <li>• Terms of world trade including fluctuations affecting cash crops. Dumping of subsidised farm products on local markets. Import tariffs and restrictions.</li> <li>• Impact of ‘recession’.</li> <li>• War. In 2014, many countries affected. Obstacles to development – destruction, death, scorched earth tactics, disruption to food supplies, financial costs, etc.</li> <li>• Corruption within governments: Zimbabwe – Mugabe, Liberia – Charles Taylor.</li> <li>• Civil unrest and ethnic conflict in CAR, Kenya, Darfur, Somalia. Growth of Islamist terror groups in various countries.</li> <li>• Agriculture progress report of World Bank questioned by Action Aid with special reference to Uganda where agriculture extension programmes were stopped. Other reports question the sustainability of Uganda’s Poverty Eradication Action Plan.</li> <li>• Divided views within the UN on the way forward and failure of many members to reach the 0.7% of GNP to UN for development programmes.</li> <li>• Effect of natural disasters.</li> <li>• Debate over introduction of the UN’s Sustainable Development Goals “(SDG’s)”</li> </ul> <p>Any other relevant points.</p>		

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	12	<p><b>'Pass' and better answers should feature developed, exemplified knowledge and understanding of:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ways in which the UN may respond to threats to peace and security</li> <li>• Impact of UN responses on threats to peace and security</li> </ul> <p><b>And</b> balanced comment on the effectiveness of the UN in dealing with threats to international peace and security</p> <p><b>Answers may refer to:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The General Assembly of the UN is the main deliberative organ of the UN and is composed of representatives of all member states. The work of the UN derives largely from mandates given by the General Assembly. Reform of the General Assembly remains a topic of debate.</li> <li>• The Security Council has primary responsibility, under the UN Charter, for the maintenance of international peace and security. Reform of the Security Council is under consideration.</li> <li>• Functions and powers of Security Council include: maintain peace and security (conflict prevention); investigate disputes and recommend methods of resolving disputes (peace-making); controlling armaments in areas of conflict and/or calling on members to apply economic sanctions and/or to take military action against an aggressor (peace enforcement/peace-building).</li> <li>• While decisions about establishing, maintaining or expanding peacekeeping operation are taken by the Security Council, the financing of UN peacekeeping operations is the collective responsibility of all UN member states. UN budget for peacekeeping in 2013–14 was \$7.54 billion. The US provided 28.4% of the UN's peacekeeping budget of 2013–14.</li> <li>• UN's democracy agenda (UNDEF). Established to support democracy; assistance given in wide range of countries including Afghanistan, Bosnia and Palestinian territories.</li> <li>• View that it is easier to be critical of the UN rather than see where it has been 'quietly successful' eg Cyprus, Kashmir, Liberia and the Democratic Republic of Congo</li> <li>• UN's view that its peacekeeping missions are vital (peacekeeping supports a peace process; it is not a substitute), effective (with the proper mandate) and efficient and cost-effective.</li> </ul>	15	

Question		Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
C	12	<p>(cont)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In 2014, there were 16 on-going UN peacekeeping missions around the world involving 90 000 troops and 15 000 other staff.</li> <li>• View that although UN's institutional arrangements are complex the real problem for the UN is that its members are deeply divided about what they want from it.</li> <li>• Veto by P5 in UN Security Council has been block on UN taking effective action particularly by US in Middle East/Israel and Russia in Chechnya, Ukraine, and Georgia. US/UK criticism of China/Russia veto in response to Syrian government and internal unrest.</li> <li>• UN largely ignored by USA (and other countries) in respect of Iraq.</li> <li>• N. Korea and Iran's continued defiance of UN with regard to nuclear capability.</li> <li>• Style of UN Secretary-General. Kofi Annan very high profile and wishing to be seen to be involved. Ban Ki-moon more low-key working hard in the background.</li> <li>• Responses to terrorism – UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy. However, unlikely to act without military backing of USA. Failure to stop rise of IS, Boko Haram, Al Shabaab etc.</li> <li>• In 2001, UN Security Council authorised US to overthrow the Taleban in Afghanistan and for US and allies to set up the International Security Assistance Force (ISAF).</li> <li>• UN backing for enforced no-fly zone (enforced by NATO war planes) which began process of Gaddafi's removal. View that the UN can have more immediate success when it works with an organisation such as NATO which has the military strength and/or a more robust mandate.</li> <li>• The UN's role in Ukraine has largely concerned the delivery of humanitarian aid. Criticism that all they can do is criticise the Russians and their Ukrainian allies "in the strongest terms". Long standing criticism that the UN is unable/unwilling to take meaningful actions against powerful nations such as Russia (especially if they are one of the permanent members of the Security Council.)</li> <li>• There are an average of 50 conflicts in the world in any given year.</li> <li>• Any other relevant points.</li> </ul>		

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]



**2015 Modern Studies Paper 2**

**Higher**

**Finalised Marking Instructions**

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2015

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from SQA's NQ Assessment team.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Assessment team may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

## **Part One: General Marking Principles for: Modern Studies Higher Paper 2**

This information is provided to help you understand the general principles you must apply when marking candidate responses to questions in this Paper. These principles must be read in conjunction with the specific Marking Instructions for each question.

- (a)** Marks for each candidate response must always be assigned in line with these general marking principles and the specific Marking Instructions for the relevant question. If a specific candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed Marking Instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your Team Leader/Principal Assessor.
- (b)** Marking should always be positive ie, marks should be awarded for what is correct and not deducted for errors or omissions.

### **GENERAL MARKING ADVICE: Modern Studies Higher Paper 2**

The marking schemes are written to assist in determining the “minimal acceptable answer” rather than listing every possible correct and incorrect answer. The following notes are offered to support Markers in making judgements on candidates’ evidence, and apply to marking both end of unit assessments and course assessments.

**Part Two: Marking Instructions for each Question**

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
1	<p>Annie Garfield states, “When compared to other developed countries, the UK’s NMW is one of the lowest and in recent years it has failed to stop the number of people in low paid jobs from rising.”</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p> <p>Source C1 shows she is correct as the number of people earning less than the LW has been rising since 2010.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p> <p>But she is incorrect with regard to Source C2 as the relative value of the NMW in the UK is not one of the lowest in the developed world. The UK lies fourth behind France, Australia and Belgium.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p>	<b>3</b>	
2	<p>Annie Garfield states, “Very few believe the LW would push up wages for all employees.”</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p> <p>Annie exaggerates because Source C3 shows 53% of people surveyed believed that wages for all workers would be pushed up if the NMW was replaced with the LW. This is the largest group in this question and is a majority of respondents.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p>	<b>2</b>	
3	<p>Victor Brown states that, “In fact, the UK now has one of the lowest levels of poverty in the European Union.”</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p> <p>Victor exaggerates because Source C4 shows UK is not one of the lowest poverty levels. There are seven countries lower than the UK. UK is almost double the lowest rate which is the Czech Republic.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>1 mark</b></p>	<b>2</b>	



Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
5	<p><b>Decision Making Task or Report</b></p> <p>Zone Mark:  C Pass = 10 or 11  B Pass = 12 or 13  A Pass = 14 and above</p> <p>Use the full range of marks. Do not over-credit answers that simply paraphrase the source information in isolation. The report must feature background knowledge to pass. Use must be made of all specified sources.</p> <p><b>Credit</b></p> <p><b>A style appropriate to a report (sub-headings, chapters etc) with:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An introduction that indicates an awareness of the role to be adopted</li> <li>• Developed arguments in support of the recommendation</li> <li>• Identification of and comment on (rebuttal of) counter arguments</li> <li>• Use of appropriate background knowledge</li> <li>• Provision and use of appropriate background knowledge</li> <li>• An overall conclusion</li> </ul> <p><b>Arguments for the proposal may feature:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• LW would end poverty wages</li> <li>• reduce social inequalities – collectivist approach</li> <li>• less reliance on the benefit system leading to lower government spending</li> <li>• stimulate economy, higher tax receipts and lower unemployment</li> <li>• encourage workforce to become more skilled, loyal and motivated</li> </ul> <p><b>Arguments against the proposal may feature:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• harm economic recovery; hurt business relative to foreign competition, multi nationals would re-locate</li> <li>• unjustified: UK NMW reasonably high</li> <li>• individualist approach best way to tackle poverty and reduce inequality. “Can do” attitude, less reliance on the state.</li> <li>• employees should be paid only what they are worth, market forces</li> <li>• increase wages across employment levels, cannot be afforded</li> </ul> <p>Accept, but do not “check list”, background knowledge which may be developed from the following statements:</p>		

Question	Expected Answer(s)	Max Mark	Additional Guidance
5	<p><b>(cont)</b></p> <p><b>Source A</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• "...government... aim was to end poverty wages."</li> <li>• "the collectivist approach"</li> <li>• "...the social problems poverty creates..."</li> <li>• "more divided and unequal."</li> <li>• "ill-health and poor educational attainment"</li> <li>• "reform of the tax and benefits system"</li> <li>• "reduce our national debt"</li> </ul> <p><b>Source B</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• "...slowly emerging from recession..."</li> <li>• "has done its job by ending poverty."</li> <li>• "Many benefits exist and these should be maintained but only for our most vulnerable groups."</li> <li>• "...responsible for getting themselves out of poverty..."</li> <li>• "The free-market decides..."</li> <li>• "including the trade unions"</li> <li>• "multinational corporations..."</li> </ul> <p><b>Other background knowledge may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Number and types of workers currently receiving the NMW/earning less than the NMW/earning more than NMW but less than the LW</li> <li>• details of NMW 16–17 or 18–20 or apprentice</li> <li>• The individualist/collectivist debate</li> <li>• Consequences of widening social and economic inequalities</li> <li>• Extension of adult NMW to 21 year olds 2010</li> <li>• Austerity and its impact on inequality</li> <li>• Views of opposition to coalition social policy</li> <li>• Issues in 2015 general election campaign</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>Marks</b>     <b>20</b></p> <p style="text-align: right;"><b>Total</b>     <b>30</b></p>		

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]